

**WILLIAMSBURG
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
Tuesday, November 23, 2004**

CALL TO ORDER AND ATTENDANCE

The regular semimonthly Architectural Review Board meeting was held on Tuesday, November 23, 2004, at 6:30 p.m. in the third Floor Conference Room of the Municipal Building.

Chairman Williams called the meeting to order. Present in addition to Mr. Williams were Board members Mr. Klee, Mr. Hertzler, Mr. Durbin, Mr. Spence and Mr. Watson. Board member Mr. Walker was absent. Also present was Zoning Administrator Murphy and Zoning Officer Beck.

CONSENT AGENDA

ARB #04-114 Maloney/116 Cove Point Lane – Addition (Screen porch & deck) – Approved.

Mr. Walker motioned to approve the consent agenda as presented.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Mr. Klee, Mr. Hertzler, Mr. Durbin, Mr. Williams, Mr. Spence and Mr. Watson.
Nay: None.
Absent: Mr. Walker.
Abstain: None.

ARCHITECTURAL PRESERVATION DISTRICT

ARB #04-084 Hart/505 Capitol Landing Road – Exterior Change (Replace wood siding with synthetic siding and new trim, shingles & windows)

Mr. Williams gave an overview of Mr. Hart's case and how it prompted the Board to take a look at synthetic siding and possibly revising the **Design Review Guidelines** to allow synthetic siding to replace wood siding in some **Architectural Preservation Districts**. He noted the Board reviewed each neighborhood located in an **Architectural Preservation District** in respect to the type of siding on dwelling and determined the percentage of brick or wood siding varied in the City from 90% in some neighborhoods to below 50% in other neighborhoods such as Mr. Hart's. Mr. Williams stated the Board voted at its last meeting that the current Guidelines as pertaining to wood siding gave enough flexibility to make a change to the current Guidelines unnecessary. However, he noted the Board was developing a letter to City Council to investigate incentives

for restoring houses with wood siding using an approach similar to one that is used in Newport News.

Mr. Watson stated that in this case he would be in favor of approving Hardiplank siding because most of the houses in this neighborhood have synthetic siding.

Mr. Durbin concurred with Mr. Watson.

Mr. Williams motioned to deny ARB #04-084 for replacing wood siding with Hardiplank siding because the proposed siding is not in compliance with the **Design Review Guidelines**.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Mr. Klee, Mr. Hertzler, Mr. Williams, and Mr. Spence.

Nay: Mr. Durbin and Mr. Watson.

Absent: Mr. Walker.

Abstain: None.

ARB #04-106 Casey/114 Griffin Avenue – Exterior Change (Replace wood shingled siding with Nailite synthetic siding)

Mr. Williams noted this is the second case tabled while the Board reviewed the synthetic siding issue.

Mr. Robert Casey expressed his appreciation to the Board for looking at synthetic siding, but he did not agree with their decision. He noted the following:

- The existing shingles were deteriorating and must be replaced on the building.
- Nailite siding is permitted in West Ghent in Norfolk and he provided pictures of it being installed on his sons dwelling in West Ghent.
- He noted he had contacted several businesses (Waterfront Lumber, Custom Building Supply, Building Specialties, ABC Supply) on the availability of wood shingles and could not locate anyone who could provide wood shingles like those on the dwelling.
- He disagrees that a majority of the siding is in good shape and he doesn't think the existing shingles can be repaired.
- He apologized for letting the dwelling get into it current condition because the management company he hired did not maintain the building resulting in deterioration of the wood shingled siding.
- That Colonial Williamsburg uses composite shingles on the roofs of buildings because they are easier to maintain and safer.
- The dwelling is not that old and was there before the City's Architectural Review Board.
- New materials may not lower the standards but may raise the standards.

Mr. Williams stated that a dwelling on the Parade of Homes had used a product similar to the Nailite shingle product and when you looked at the dwelling you could tell the difference because of the seams. He noted preservation of the existing house was the intent of the **Design Review Guidelines** and that Board members support the goal of preserving homes in **Architectural Preservation Districts** as they originally appeared.

Mr. Spence noted Kerry Shackelford of Museum Resources Inc. from Providence Forge who met with the Board on October 12 to discuss the availability of wood siding could replicate the shingle on Mr. Casey's dwelling. Mr. Casey stated that it would probably cost more than he would like to spend.

Mr. Hertzler stated that he would not be in favor of replacing the wood shingles with Nailite Siding. He noted the dwelling next door contained the same wood shingled siding and was in excellent condition because of good maintenance. He expressed concern over allowing an investor that did not maintain his rental property to lower the standard of material on the dwelling. He considered this to be unfair to other property owners on the street and within the City that have taken care of their homes.

Mr. Watson concurred noting the close proximity of this dwelling to Pollard Park and Chandler Court which are neighborhoods on the National Register of Historic Places.

Mr. Klee noted this dwelling is also located on the City's Listing of Significant Architecture and agreed with Mr. Hertzler and Mr. Watson.

Mr. Durbin concurred with Mr. Hertzler, Mr. Watson and Mr. Klee.

Mr. Hertzler motioned to deny ARB #04-106 for replacing wood shingle siding with Nailite shingle siding because the proposed siding is not in compliance with the **Design Review Guidelines**.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Mr. Klee, Mr. Hertzler, Mr. Durbin, Mr. Williams, Mr. Spence and Mr. Watson.
Nay: None.
Absent: Mr. Walker.
Abstain: None.

ARB #04-113 CWF/Abby Aldrich Rockefeller Folk Art Museum/326 West Francis Street – Addition to DeWitt Wallace Decorative Arts Museum

Sam Anderson, Architect, and Ron Hurts presented their request for the addition to DeWitt Wallace Decorative Arts Museum. Mr. Anderson noted the following:

- The windows are needed to give people a sense of orientation and to let more natural light into the building.
- The windows also provide a connection back to where you entered the building.
- The existing skylights were leaking suggesting a different solution to allow light into the space.
- The view of the windows from the north will be skewed because they were pushed back to the south side of the building to limit their visibility.

Mr. Klee asked if the profile of the windows could be lowered. Mr. Anderson stated the windows were about four feet and if less than four feet would appear as a slot window which was not acceptable.

Mr. Hertzler asked if the red fence was being removed. Mr. Anderson stated the red fence was not being removed and in fact additional landscaping was proposed to reduce the visibility of the building addition from Francis Street.

Mr. Williams motioned to approve ARB #04-113 as presented.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Mr. Hertzler, Mr. Durbin, Mr. Williams and Mr. Watson.
Nay: None.
Absent: Mr. Walker.
Abstain: Mr. Klee and Mr. Spence.

OTHER BUSINESS

Minutes November 9, 2004

The minutes were approved with two changes as noted by Mr. Hertzler and Mr. Durbin.

Letter to City Council

The Board agreed to look at drafts by Mr. Williams and Mr. Hertzler and decide on a final letter at the next meeting.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:00 P.M.

Jason Beck
Zoning Officer